

Requisite Savvy:

It's What Could Help Women Navigate through the Social Constructs of Music School

Deborah J. Sidel

MATX -791

Professor Sandy Goldie

December 4, 2015

Preface

One of life's most important decisions is whether or not to attend college. Many professional goals are unattainable without higher educational degrees and the field of music is often regarded as a precarious choice, specifically, financially precarious. Women students who elect to pursue professional training in university music departments come from disparate backgrounds and undoubtedly bring an array of expectations and bravado or anxieties with them that will inform their experiences. Knowledge, skills, and meaning-making will be gained through the process of their lived experiences. In orienting them to the academic and social terrain of music school, both the content of information and the way that it is initially presented to women students could function as an important intervention. Having access to certain information as they enter school could provide a framework that sustains them psychologically and emotionally. Music departments can be insular environments within educational institutions where music is packaged as a rational, masculine, and heterosexual endeavor. There is a long tradition of power relations, a hierarchy of elitism or privilege and a process of socialization awaiting them. This is the arena within which women students will develop occupational identities and make career choices. Being naïve is an avoidable predicament.

Parameters

In the domain of social constructionist thought, a social construct is an idea or perception that appears to be natural and obvious to people who accept it but may or may not represent reality. They "define meanings, notions, or connotations that are assigned to objects and events in the environment and to people's notions of their relationships to and interactions with these

objects.”¹ Within this terse definition there is much to debate over what constitutes objective truth. However, such a debate is not the purpose of this project. Rather, social constructs will provisionally be considered to be the outcome of human decisions based on social facts and surrounding social conventions, specifically pertaining to the milieu of collegiate music departments. The concept of “requisite savvy” stems from simply synthesizing these common definitions: “made necessary by particular circumstances or regulations” with “shrewdness and practical knowledge; the ability to make good judgements”. To clarify, the term “women” is used to refer to people within the female continuum of gendered relations. The aim of this project is to offer insights and resource materials to women music students that are pragmatic, to possibly ameliorate the inherent distress in navigating the challenges embedded in collegiate music matriculation. Broadly speaking, the intention of this project is attempting preemptive mentorship via a written text.

What would be truly helpful in facilitating the instilling of the kind of savvy that would empower women students? Obviously there is no definitive answer to this. Ultimately, each student is unique, experiencing a matrix of circumstances or dynamics of intersectionality that impact her individually. However, I would argue that there are pertinent theoretical frameworks such as descriptive identity theories and feminist criticism that could readily contribute to significant portions of the establishment of requisite savvy. Each student’s interaction with the following information is an unknown potential whose actualization is beyond the scope of this current project. In the spirit of pragmatism, a compilation of online resources pertaining to

¹ International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences. 2008. *Encyclopedia.com*. October 19, 2015), 1.

women in music will be provided, along with a list of compositions by women appropriate for various educational settings. Also included is a poster which was created to serve as an example of another type of textual tool or option in gaining knowledge about women in music.

Identity Theory Literature Sources

In *Finding Herself: Pathways to Identity Development in Women*, Ruthellen Josselson, who is a distinguished psychotherapist, turns to the female non-patient population for her study of pathways to identity formation. Her work is greatly impacted by Erickson's theories of identity as an unconscious process that becomes "the interface between the individual and the world, defining as it does what the individual will stand for and be recognized as."² She states that identity is not just a list of aspects but how a person synthesizes them and experiences them. Josselson follows the methodology of Marcia (1966) and embraces four descriptive types of identity: foreclosed, achievement, moratorium, and diffusion.³ "Women move along in the world through relational connections: Whom they know has much to do with whom – and how – they become."⁴ She further comments that "communion is central to female development – women are likely to opt for attachment before pursuing their agentic needs".⁵ Josselson thinks that we never fully separate from our mothers and women lack mentors to replace them professionally. Furthermore, women's inner emotional security directly impacts her identity

² Ruthellen Josselson, *Finding Herself: Pathways to Identity Development in Women* (San Francisco, California: Jossey-Bass Inc., 1987), 8.

³ Ibid. 30.

⁴ Ibid. 169.

⁵ Ibid. 171.

formation along with her ability to tolerate uncertainty. Identity formation is enhanced by self-awareness and a sense of one's competency and abilities independent of praise from others.⁶ She posits that the history of separation-individuation is different for women and men.⁷ Josselson's work aptly discusses the central issue of how important relationships are to women, specifically mentorship. Relational meaning-making is a distinctive style of constructing identity and impacts self-concepts, women's thoughts and feelings about themselves. This core issue plays out in music classrooms and studios. Marie McCarthy, chair of the music department at the University of Michigan, has studied the intersections of social and cultural foundations in the historical development of music education internationally. She brings in a musical perspective.

In her 1999 article, "Gendered Discourse and the Construction of Identity: Toward a Liberated Pedagogy in Music Education", McCarthy states; "Gendered discourse in the music classroom occurs at various levels. Pedagogy is at the heart of discourse, where life is breathed into texts, where meanings are constructed, where gender relations are played out, and where choices are offered and possibilities are opened."⁸ Gender is a culture specific construct which is constantly evolving and feminist scholars have generated much push back on the binary construction of female and male as prescriptive labels. Incorporating Foucault's theory, McCarthy purports that music equals culture which equals a primary site of power relations and transmission and transaction of gender roles.⁹ Music is a form of and medium of gendered discourse. Musical performances create a high profile for music itself which contributes to the

⁶ Ibid. 188

⁷ Ibid. 189.

⁸ Marie McCarthy, "Gendered Discourse and the Construction of Identity: Toward a Liberated Pedagogy in Music Education," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 33 (4) (1999), 120.

⁹ Ibid. 115.

institutional construction of gender.¹⁰ Teacher's perceptions are part of the intersectionality of what transpires in classrooms and McCarthy urges us to reexamine our assumptions about gender and musical ability in order to transform music classrooms. Taking this even farther into the academic and social terrain of music school is Brian Roberts, a Canadian music professor and award winning author.

Roberts hones in on the identity construction of emerging music educators in his two articles, "Who's in the Mirror? Issues Surrounding the Identity Construction of Music Educators" and "Music Teacher Education as Identity Construction". In the former, Roberts is most interested in how a "musician" get to be a music teacher. He states that people can be many things and that they don't have to be all of them at the same time.¹¹ "For the music education student in the university music school, the desire to be viewed as centrally, pivotally, essentially or *really* as a musician is the central point".¹² Roberts claims that music departments breed insular, competitive, hierarchal environments that privilege the mastering of technically demanding Western art music-making which does not ultimately serve students preparing to become educators. "Music as an academic discipline is unique in that teaching it resides in doing or being a performing musician first."¹³ He discusses the *labelling perspective* from sociologists and asserts that music education majors are stigmatized. In his second article, Roberts sees the process of constructing identities as depending on social interactions. Music majors are consumed with establishing their reputation amongst their classmates which becomes an external

¹⁰ Ibid. 117.

¹¹ Brian Roberts, "Who's in the Mirror? Issues Surrounding the Identity Construction of Music Educators" In *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* Vol 3, #2. (July 2004), 4.

¹² Ibid. 8.

¹³ Ibid. 24.

symbol of “who they are”.¹⁴ Music teachers are usually trained as instrumentalists/vocalists in a coded hierarchal method and take this mode of pedagogy with them into their classrooms where they teach. Roberts’ major intervention is that he thinks that “every effort must be made within the schools of music and education at the university to help you first create firstly and identify as a *teacher* who, secondly, happens to have, and teaches on the basis of , an extraordinary and highly developed musical skill.”¹⁵ Introducing women students to the work of Josselson, McCarthy, and Roberts would impart a strong theoretical framework with which to engage, providing a way to distill pertinent concepts into valuable discourses. Feminist scholars also have much to offer women music students because their work is concerned with the lived experiences and perspectives of women and the challenges that they encounter within patriarchy. Hence, the feminist critical lens could be most useful in cultivating requisite savvy.

Feminist Musicological Scholarship - Literature Sources

Robert Lamb is an associate professor at Queens University in Canada where she teaches classes in music and music education as well as courses on gender issues in music. In her 1994 article, “Feminism as Critique in Philosophy of Music Education”, she asks “by shifting from men’s to women’s perspectives, how might this alter the fundamental categories, methodologies and self-understanding of music, particularly transmitted through the educational process?”¹⁶

¹⁴ Brain Roberts, "Music Teacher Education as Identity Construction, In " International Journal of Music Education 18, no. 1 (1991), 35.

¹⁵ Brain Roberts, “Who’s in the Mirror?” 38.

¹⁶ Roberta Lamb, “Feminism as Critique in Philosophy of Music Education." (*Philosophy of Music Education review*, 1994), 62.

Lamb is placing feminism as critique within the philosophy of music education and explores categories of feminist theory by drawing on Rosemary Tong's identity theories. By using Tong as a guide Lamb offers brief definitions of feminist theories with examples applicable to music education. In a nutshell: liberal feminist analysis would be concerned with issues of equal opportunity for students and teachers while psychoanalytical might look for solutions to women's absence from music and music education in re-worked and re-visioned psychological constructs.¹⁷ Radical feminist would cite the patriarchal constructions of sexuality as the root of the problem. Women's music (aesthetic) of all kinds would be important within the model of feminism and a critique of the androcentricity of Western art music would be central. Marxist/socialist would analyze the inequalities within the social structure of class differences and access to music and address issues of power in the production and reproduction of music. Standpoint theory may be a starting point to examine the gender divisions of labor in music education, including women's alienation from aspects of production and reproduction of music as well as critiquing commodity exchanges. Postmodern is concerned with language and the work of Lacan, Derrida, and Foucault and would examine the margins of music education as a "celebration of multiplicity".¹⁸ She cautions that each of these critical lens is partial.

Lamb challenges the assumed neutrality within aesthetics as a philosophy as well as the universality and transcendence that are implied in the formal "elements of music".¹⁹ Performing music can be an empowering experience for women and aid in constructing a self-identity, yet

¹⁷ Ibid. 60.

¹⁸ Ibid. 61-62.

¹⁹ Ibid. 65.

there are questions of power embedded within it.²⁰ She argues that performances have long been reified within western musical traditions and that this is an elitist practice and that the analytical prowess used in championing these performances (compositions, too) has become an end in itself or a display unto itself and limits interpretations.²¹ In her 1993 article, “The Possibilities of/for Feminist Music Criticism in Music Education”, Lamb asks “what does music have to do with feminism?” and “how does the music of Western art tradition communicate, reinforce or reinterpret the values of patriarchal culture within aesthetic media?”²² These are important questions, transformative questions that could facilitate insights into the “bigger picture” for women students. Lamb envisions expanding beyond merely adding women composers’ works to the dominant canonic tradition to “examining the music of women as it exists on the margins of patriarchal society and attempting to define the values created by their music to cultures and experiences on their own aesthetic and political terms.”²³ Feminist ethnomusicologist, Ellen Koskoff, is also concerned about the musical experiences of women, the implications of gender upon music performance, how gender ideology affects a society’s musical thinking and how music functions in each correlating society.

In her “Introduction to Women and Music in Cross-Cultural Perspective”, Koskoff says that she wants to pursue “how music behavior itself reflects and symbolizes gender behavior”.²⁴ Socially constructed gender categories are also prestige systems and researchers are challenged

²⁰ Ibid. 67.

²¹ Ibid. 66.

²² Robert Lamb, “The Possibilities of/for Feminist Music Criticism in Music Education” (*British Journal of Music Education* 10, no. 03, 1993), 172.

²³ Ibid. 173.

²⁴ Ellen Koskoff, “Introduction to Women and Music in Cross-Cultural Perspective” In *A Feminist Ethnomusicology: Writings on Music and Gender*, (University of Illinois Press, 2014), 36.

to make distinctions between sex-and gender-related concepts.²⁵ Notions of power saturate music performances where behaviors that challenge or threaten established social/sexual order can be expressed. Music is a conceptual framework that is a representation of power relations and Koskoff asks “what is the relationship between gender, music, and social standing or prestige?”²⁶ She states that in all known societies, men’s actions receive higher value and prestige than those of women, and frequently a loss of male status is equated with female-related behavior.²⁷ Koskoff proposes constructing a model of inquiry that includes the cultural concepts of power, gender, music, and value which would be a multi-faceted model consisting of separate continuums that would be sensitive to the complexities of social contexts.²⁸ She recently published *A Feminist Ethnomusicology: Writings on Music and Gender* in 2014. In her chapter, “When Women Play: The Relationship between Musical Instruments and Gender Style”, Koskoff mentions that all performance may be regarded as a locus of power and instrumental musical performance is linked to cultural notions of gender and control that vocal performance is not.²⁹ Musical instruments can be instruments of power and control. Gender stratification occurs when value is given to one gender over the other and infers a particular style associated with the privileged gender as well. Koskoff concludes that a deeper understanding of the unequal division of musical roles can be gained when one examines the complex relationship between symbolic associations, gender ideologies, and social and economic structures within a society.³⁰

²⁵ Ibid. 37.

²⁶ Ibid. 42.

²⁷ Ibid. 42.

²⁸ Ibid. 43.

²⁹ Ellen Koskoff, “When Women Play: The Relationship between Musical Instruments and Gender Style” In” In *A Feminist Ethnomusicology: Writings on Music and Gender*, (University of Illinois Press, 2014), 123.

³⁰ Ibid. 129.

Koskoff's research work generates an alternative paradigm through which to conceptualize our musicality, to ponder the immensity of the importance of "context", and to broaden our perspectives.

Feminist scholars ubiquitously critique the grand narrative of the transcendence of music in a very cerebral fashion and few discuss the physicality of music-making and reception. Suzanne Cusick boldly steps into the void in her chapter, "On Musical Performances of Gender and Sex" in *Audible Traces: Gender, Identity, and Music*. She is a professor at New York University and as a musicologist has written extensively about gender and sexuality (queer theory) in early modern Italy and North America. In this chapter she considers the framework of "embodied music criticism" and its implications for musicological scholarship. She proposes developing a performance-centered rather than a listening-centered music criticism that would address both the literal and the figurative ways bodily actions constitute musical performances. Judith Butler's theories about gender being a set of repeated performances are applied to the physical production of voices and Cusick agrees with Butler's assertion that gender and sex are both the result of human actions or performances.³¹ She sees how music performances are simultaneously expressing the performances of bodies. Music is an idea that is performed through a body, by a body for other bodies. This concept is entangled in performances of Francesca Caccini done by Cusick who would be rendering ideas from the seventeenth century bodily performances with or

³¹ Suzanne, Cusick, "On Musical Performances of Gender and Sex" In *Audible Traces: Gender, Identity, and Music*, (Theodore Front Music, 1999), 26.

through her twentieth- century body. This could be viewed as a performance of a dialogue or contrapuntal relationship between the two embodiments.³²

Cusick proposes that because voices originate inside the body's borders and not on the body's surfaces, voices do stand for the bodily imperatives of biological sex. We commonly think of the voice as being the body yet voices are culturally constructed, a negotiated relationship. Performances of Song (voices) are "primary sites for performances of sex, gender, and even sexuality."³³ They cross the body's borders and singers allow cultural norms to penetrate and discipline their physical interior spaces and actions.³⁴ The discipline of Tonality is deeply embedded and vocal registers express sexuality in an unconscious if not compulsory way. Boys "abandon the register that they might share with girls and chose to re-learn the interior bodily performances of voice production required to produce a manly lower register of Speech."³⁵ In contrast, girls are most often told their voices do not change and they continue onto adulthood using their childhood vocalizations.³⁶ Singing requires more and deeper bodily discipline (throat and chest) than speaking (mouth) does. Fewer men sing than women in our contemporary culture. Cusick uses a vocalist from Pearl Jam to exemplify her theory about masculinity as a relationship to Culture rather than an inevitable consequence of hormones.³⁷ The Indigo Girls use their voices in ways that resist cultural heterosexual norms. Cusick ponders about what singing meant to people in Caccini's time, how singing could threaten a woman's

³² Ibid. 28.

³³ Ibid. 29.

³⁴ Ibid. 31.

³⁵ Ibid. 32.

³⁶ Ibid. 33.

³⁷ Ibid. 36.

reputation. Also of interest to her are identifying the changes in technical regimes of vocal training as our medical understanding of the body evolved ³⁸ because the history of musical practices is inextricable from the history of the body. As music scholars embodied-music criticism would require that we move away from the premise that music is primarily a transcendent or aesthetic experience. “Instead, intellectual inquiry about music would be grounded in the premise that music is a functional tool of culture, a medium through which people negotiate their relationships to others, to their cohort, and to their cohort’s values.” ³⁹ Cusick suggests that music could be enjoyed by” thinking of it as among the discourses through which we perform ourselves as embodied, having gender and sex.”⁴⁰ Rather than an escape from this world, it could be a site where the body enacts resistance, evasion, liberation and joy and gives us a means to remake our world.

Cusick’s innovative work captures the essence of somatic issues in musical performance and reception practices and offers a fresh perspective with her proposed embodied music criticism. Musicians could be described as fine motor skilled athletes. Women are relentlessly bombarded with messages about their bodies from advertisements and one of the cornerstone tenets of the feminist movement is that “biology is not destiny”. Research has shown that students learn best by talking and sharing ideas amongst themselves; conversing is a productive mode of knowledge construction. Verbally processing or “unpacking” Cusick’s work could fuel animated discourses at topical forums tailored for women students. Another important complementary component

³⁸ Ibid. 40.

³⁹ Ibid. 42.

⁴⁰ Ibid. 42.

that will strengthen, support, and sustain newly acquired requisite savvy is introducing existing material resources, implicitly useful items or organizational networks.

Other Available Resource Materials

If one is motivated to implement change in the musical collegiate arena, there are strategic actions that could be pursued. Accessing the lineage of research literature and musical works by women coupled with investigating existing pedagogical methods would be intelligent endeavors. My first compilation of online resources pertaining to women in music is a modest attempt at formulating a paradigmatic archive. There are many websites hosted by educational institutions which are gender/ women studies and music studies program specific while others can be found at university library sites. Free access to documentaries, shorter videos and recordings is easily obtained. There are publishing companies devoted to promoting women-centric musical compositions, historical treatises, textbooks, supplementary pedagogical materials such as posters, children's books whose protagonists are female musicians, and musical recordings.

Professional organizations that honor, support, and champion women in music have websites as well. Becoming an active member in one of them could be one way to contribute to a stronger sense of identity as a women in music and bolster self-esteem. This could also create new opportunities for potential professional networking, finding role models and or mentors. Women music students could create their own student organization and set up a website or Facebook page where a truly "open" and ongoing discourse could thrive. There are also several software programs specifically designed for creating historical timelines with multi-media components that would incorporate text, video, sound, and hypertexts. These could be implemented by

instructors teaching traditional music history, either through presentations or as assignments to be constructed by students with the intent to be women-centric.

The traditional masculine canon emerged through the analysis of and repeated performances of a specific set of composers' works. The analysis of and consistent performance of works by women composers are strategic maneuvers that could gain momentum from the "bottom up" and or "top down", if persistently requested in mass with the uncompromising expectation that it must be so. This would provide a methodology by which to construct an enduring public profile of women's musicality. There is no reason to wait until the collegiate level to consistently perform music by women. My compilation of repertoire by women for elementary through high school classes and ensembles could be implemented in that "down up" or "top down" continuum of persistence.

Requisite Savvy's Legacy

The hypothetical legacy of women music students who obtain requisite savvy is an intriguing scenario to ponder. Asking students to envision themselves in the future would be a quintessential self-reflective question to ask as a concluding orientation session exercise. Hopefully they will be better equipped to navigate the pressures of music school matriculation, to be more aware of their processes and cognizant of the hierarchal politics of academia as they pursue their goals - with their heads held high.

Bibliography

- Abes, Elisa S., Susan R. Jones, and Marylu K. McEwen. "Reconceptualizing the Model of Multiple Dimensions of Identity: The Role of Meaning-Making Capacity in the Construction of Multiple Identities." *Journal of College Student Development* 48, no. 1 (2007): 1-22. https://muse-jhu-edu.proxy.library.vcu.edu/journals/journal_of_college_student_development/v048/48.1abes.html
- Abramo, Joseph Michael. "Queering Informal Pedagogy: Sexuality and Popular Music in School." *Music Education Research* 13, no. 4 (2011): 465-477. <http://web.b.ebscohost.com.proxy.library.vcu.edu/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=e071629d-2fe5-4be7-9803-eb98726d728c%40sessionmgr113&vid=1&hid=125>
- Bennett, Dawn. "A gendered study of the working patterns of classical musicians: implications for practice." *International Journal of Music Education* 26, no. 1 (2008): 89-100. <http://ijm.sagepub.com> (Accessed September 25, 2015)
- Bouij, Christer. "Two theoretical perspectives on the socialization of music teachers." *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 3, no. 3 (2004): 1-14. <http://act.maydaygroup.org/>
- Boyce-Tillman, June. "Women's ways of knowing." *British Journal of Music Education* 10, no. 03 (1993): 153-161. (Accessed September 23, 2015)
- Brickell, Chris. "The sociological construction of gender and sexuality." *The Sociological Review* 54, no. 1 (2006): 87-113.
- Citron, Marcia J. "Women and the western art canon: Where are we now?" *Notes* 64 (2) (2007): 209-15. <https://muse-jhu-edu.proxy.library.vcu.edu/journals/notes/v064/64.2citron.html>
- Cusick, Suzanne G. "On Musical Performances of Gender and Sex" In *Audible Traces: Gender, Identity, and Music*, edited by Elaine Barkin and Lydia Hamessley, 25-49. Theodore Front Music. 1999.
- Gould, Elizabeth S. "Cultural Contexts of Exclusion: Women College Band Directors." *Research and Issues in Music Education* 1, no. 1 (2003): n1. 1-18. <http://www.stthomas.edu/rimeonline/voll/gould1.htm>
- Green, Lucy. "Music, Gender and Education: A Report on Some Exploratory Research," *B.F. Music Ed.* 10 (1993), 219-253. (Accessed September 23, 2015)
- _____. "Gender, musical meaning, and education" In *Philosophy of Music Education Review*. (1994): 99- 105. <http://proxy.library.vcu.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&AuthType=ip,url,cookie,uid&db=nlebk&AN=54564&site=ehost-live&scope=site>
- Josselson, Ruthellen. *Finding Herself: Pathways to Identity Development in Women*. San Francisco, California: Jossey-Bass Inc. 1987.
- Koskoff, Ellen. "Forward" In *Music and Gender*, edited by Pirkko Moisala and Beverly Diamond, ix-xiii. Urbana: University of Illinois Press. 2000.

- _____. "Introduction to Women and Music in Cross-Cultural Perspective" In *A Feminist Ethnomusicology: Writings on Music and Gender*. 31-43. University of Illinois Press, 2014.
- _____. "When Women Play: The Relationship between Musical Instruments and Gender Style" In *A Feminist Ethnomusicology: Writings on Music and Gender*. 122-132. University of Illinois Press, 2014.
- Lamb, Roberta. "Feminism as Critique in Philosophy of Music Education." *Philosophy of Music Education review* (1994): 59-74.
http://www.jstor.org.proxy.library.vcu.edu/stable/40327073?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents
- _____. "The Possibilities of/for Feminist Music Criticism in Music Education". *British Journal of Music Education* 10, no. 03 (1993): 169-180. (Accessed September 23, 2015)
- Macarthur, Sally. *Feminist Aesthetics in Music*. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press. 2002.
- McCarthy, Marie. "Gendered Discourse and the Construction of Identity: Toward a Liberated Pedagogy in Music Education," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 33 (4) (1999): 109-125.
<http://www.jstor.org.proxy.library.vcu.edu/stable/3333724?origin=crossref>
- Roberts, Brian. "Music Teacher Education as Identity Construction." *International Journal of Music Education* 18, no. 1 (1991): 30-39. (Accessed September 23, 2015)
- _____. Who's in the Mirror? Issues Surrounding the Identity Construction of Music Educators. In *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education Vol 3, #2*. (July 2004): 2-42.
<http://act.maydaygroup.org/>
- Simpson, Helen. "Seeking the female, through the holistic study of music." *British Journal of Music Education* 10, no. 03 (1993): 163-167. (Accessed September 23, 2015)
- "Social Constructs" International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences. 2008. *Encyclopedia.com*. Accessed October, 19, 2015. <http://www.encyclopedia.com/doc/1G2-3045302485.html>
- Stets, Jan E., and Peter J. Burke. "Identity theory and social identity theory." *Social Psychology Quarterly* (2000): 224-237. (Accessed September 23, 2015)